21 Questions to Ponder Over

Maulana Ghulam Hussain Na'eemi of Sahiwa'al, Pakistan was a Sunni scholar who after considerable research converted to the Shi'a Ithna Asharee Faith. The rationale for his conversion was that he had questions that he found the Ahlul' Sunnah Ulema could not answer satisfactorily. These are those questions; they remain unanswered to this day. Tragically he was martyred for his beliefs, may Allah (swt) reward him and grant him a place in Paradise. Footnotes have been added for the purposes of further clarity.

1. History testifies that when Hadhrath Muhammad (saaws) declared his Prophethood (saaws), the Quraysh[1] subjected the Bani Hashim to a boycott. Hadhrath Abu Talib (as) took the tribe to an area called Shib Abi Talib where they remained for three years, suffering from immense hardship[2]. Where were Hadhrath Abu Bakr and Hadhrath Umar during that period? They were in Makkah so why did they not help the Holy Prophet (saaws)? If they were unable to join the Prophet (saaws) at the Shib Abi Talib is there any evidence that they provided any type of support (food etc), breaching the agreement that the Quraysh boycott all food / business transactions with Bani Hashim?

2. Hadhrath Fatima Zahra (sa) died 6 months after her father (saaws), Hadhrath Abu Bakr died two and a half years later and Hadhrath Umar in 24 Hijri. Despite their later deaths how is it that they attained burial sites next to the Prophet (saaws) and not Hadhrath Fatima (as)? Did she request that she be buried away from her father? If so, why? Or did the Muslims prevent her burial? **(see Sahih al Bukhari Arabic - English Vol 5 hadith number 546)**.

3. Amongst the companions Hadhrath Abu Bakr is viewed as the most superior on account of his closeness to the Holy Prophet (saaws). If this is indeed the case then why did the Holy Prophet (saaws) not select him to be his brother when he (saaws) divided the companions in to pairs on the Day of Brotherhood? Rather, the Prophet (saaws) chose Hadhrath Ali (as) saying **"You are my brother in this world and the next"**[3], so on what basis is Hadhrath Abu Bakr closer?

4. The books of Ahlul' Sunnah are replete with traditions narrated by Hadhrath Aysha, Abu Hurraira and Abdullah Ibne Umar. Their narration's; far exceed those relayed by Hadhrath Ali (as), Hadhrath Fatima (sa), Hadhrath Hassan (as) and Hadhrath Hussain (as). Why is this the case? When the Prophet (saaws) declared **"I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is it's Gate"**, did Hadhrath Ali (as) benefit less from the company of the Prophet (saaws) than these individuals?

5. If Hadhrath Ali (as) had no differences with the first three Khalifa's why did he not participate in any battles that took place during their reigns, particularly when Jihad against the Kuffar is deemed a major duty upon the Muslim? If he did not view it as necessary at that time, then why did he during his own Khilafath whilst in his fifties unsheathe his sword and participate in the battles of Jamal, Sifeen and Naharwan?

6. If (as is the usual allegation) the Shi'as were responsible for killing Imam Hussain (as) then why did the majority Ahlul'Sunnah not come to his aid? After all they were in the majority, there were millions of such individuals, what was their position at that time?

7. If Hadhrath Umar was correct when he denied the dying request of the Holy Prophet (saaws) on the premise that the 'Qur'an is sufficient for us' **(Sahih al Bukhari Vol 7 hadith number 573)** what will be the reward for accusing the Holy Prophet (saaws) of speaking nonsense? **(See Sahih al-Bukhari Vol 5 number 716)**

---

1 "the Quraysh gathered together to confer and decided to draw up a document in which they undertook not to marry women from Banu Hashim and the Banu al Muttalib, or to give them women in marriage, or to sell anything to them or buy anything from them. They drew up a written contract to that effect and solemnly pledged themselves to observe it. They then hung up the document in the interior of the Ka'bah to make it even more binding upon themselves. When Quraysh did this, the Banu Hashim and the Banu al-Muttalib joined with 'Abu Talib, went with him to his valley and gathered round him there; but 'Abu Lahab 'Abd al Uzza b. 'Abd al-Muttalib left the Banu Hashim and went with the Quraysh supporting them against 'Abu Talib. This state of affairs continued for two or three years, until the two clans were exhausted, since nothing reached any of them except what was sent secretly by those of the Quraysh who wished to maintain relations with them". (Taken from The History of al-Tabari, Volume 6 page 81 – Muhammad at Mecca, translated by W.Montgommery & M.V. MacDonald)

2 "These days were very hard with them and very often they had to feed on the leaves TALH or plantain" (taken from Siratun Nabi by Shibli Numani Vol 1 p 218, English translation by M. Tayyib Bakhsh Budayuni.

3 See The History of the Khailfahs who took the right way, by Jalaladeen Suyuti, English translation by Abdassamad Clarke p177, (Taha publishers)

8. Allah (swt) sent 124,000 Prophet's to guide mankind. Is there any proof that on the deaths of any one of these Prophet's his companions failed to attend his funeral preferring to participate in the selection of his successor? If no such precedent exists then why did the Prophet (saaws)'s companions follow this approach[4]?

9. Of the 124,000 Prophets' that Allah (swt) sent, what evidence is there that they left everything for their followers as Sadaqah (Charity)? If they did, then why did the Prophet (saaws)'s wives not give all their possessions to the Islamic State? After all, Ahl'ul Sunnah consider the wives to be Ahlul'bayt. Sadaqah is haram on the Ahlul'bayt, this being the case why did they hold on to their possessions?

10. We read in the Holy Qur'an ***"And whoever kills a believer intentionally, his recompense shall be hell, he shall abide therein and God's wrath (Ghazibullaho) shall be on him and his curse (lanato), and is prepared for him a great torment" (Surah Nisa, v 93)*** History testifies that during the battles of Sifeen and Jamal 70,800 Muslims lost their lives. What is the position of the killers here? Is this verse not applicable to them? If these individuals opposed the Khalifa of the time and were responsible for spreading fitnah (dissension) and murder, what will be their position on the Day of Judgement?

11. Allah (swt) tells us in the Holy Qur'an ***"And of the people of Madina are those who are bent on hypocrisy. You know them not, but we know them". (The Qur'an 9:101).*** The verse proves the existence of hypocrites during the lifetime of the Prophet (saaws). After the Prophet (saaws)'s death where did they go? Historians record the fact that two groups emerged following the Prophet (saaws)'s demise, Banu Hashim and their supporters, the State and their supporters. Which side did the hypocrites join?

12. Ahl'ul Sunnah have four principles of law the Qur'an, Sunnah, Ijtihad and Qiyas. Were any of these principles adopted by the parties during their discussions about the Prophet's successor at the Saqifa?

13. If rejecting a Rightly Guided Khalifa is tantamount to apostasy and rebelling against <u>any</u> khalifa even Yazid ibn Mu'awiya will lead to such persons being raised as betrayers in the next world;[5] what of those individuals who rebelled and fought the fourth rightly guided Khalifa?

14. It is a basic principle of rationality that if two parties have a dispute both can be wrong, but both can not be right. Applying this to the battles of Jamal and Sifeen, will both the murderers and the murdered be in heaven, because both were right?

15. The Holy Prophet (saaws) had said **"I swear by the one who controls my life that this man (Ali) and his Shi'a shall secure deliverance on the day of ressurection"[6] .** Do any hadith exist in which the Prophet (saaws) had guaranteed paradise for Imams Abu Hanifa, Malik, Shafi, Hanbal and their followers?

16. During her lifetime Hadhrath Aysha was a severe critic of Hadhrath Uthman, to the point that she advocated his killing[7] . How is it that following his murder, she chose to rebel against Imam Ali (as) on the premise that his killers should be apprehended? Why did she leave Makkah, portray Hadhrath Uthman as a victim and mobilise opposition from Basrah? Was this decision based on her desire to defend Hadhrath Uthman or was it motivated by her animosity towards Hadhrath Ali (as)?

18. If failing to believe in Hadhrath Aysha is an act of Kufr what opinion should we hold with regards to her killer?[8]

19. It is commonly conveyed that the companions were brave, generous, and knowledgeable and spent their time worshipping Allah (swt). If we want to determine their bravery, then let us delve in to history, how many kaffir's did the prominent companion Hadhrath Umar slay during the battles of Badr, Uhud, Khunduq, Khayber and Hunain? How many polytheists did he kill during his own Khilafath? If we wish to determine who is *firm against the unbelievers* it cannot be that individual who despite the Prophet (saaws)'s order refused to go the Kaffir's prior to the treaty of Hudaiybiya on the grounds that he had no support and instead suggested Hadhrath Uthman go on account of his relationship to the Ummaya clan[9].

---

4 "the Sahaba viewed the appointment of the Imam as so important that they preferred it to attending the Prophet's funeral" - taken from Sharra Fiqa Akbar, by Mulla Ali Qari, p 175 (publishers Muhammad Saeed and son, Qur'an Muhall, Karachi).

5 This was the verdict of Abdullah Ibn Umar in his defence of Yazid (See Sahih al Bukhari Arabic - English Volume 9 hadith number 127)

6 Tafsir Durr al Manthur, by al Hafidh Jalaladeen Suyuti in his commentary of verse 98:7

7 History records that she said the following about Hadhrath Uthman "Kill this old fool (Na'thal), for he is unbeliever", see History of Ibn Athir, v3, p206, Lisan al-Arab, v14, p141, al-Iqd al-Farid, v4, p290 and Sharh Ibn Abi al-Hadid, v16, pp 220-223

8 Hadhrath Aysha was killed by Mu'awiya (Tarikh al Islam, by Najeeb Abadi, Vol 2 p 44)

9 Al Faruq by Allamah Shibli Numani, Volume 1 page 66, English translation by Muhammad Saleem, (Ashraf Publishers)

20. The Saha Sittah has traditions in which the Holy Prophet (saaws) foretold the coming of twelve khalifa's after him[10] . Who are they? We assert that these are the twelve Imams from the Ahlul'bayt. ***Mulla Ali Qari*** whilst setting out the Hanafi interpretation of this hadith lists Yazid ibn Mu'awiya as the sixth Khalifa[11] ? Was the Holy Prophet (saaws) really referring to such a man? When we also have a hadith that states **'He who dies without giving bayah to an Imam dies the death of one belonging to the days of jahiliyya'**[12] then it is imperative that we identify and determine who these twelve khalifa's are.

21. Can anyone change Allah (swt) laws? The Qur'an states quite categorically that no one has that right **"And it is not for a believing man or woman that they should have any choice in a matter when Allah and his Messenger have decided a matter; and whoever disobeys Allah and his Messenger; surely strays off a manifest straying"**. With this verse in mind, why did Hadhrath Umar introduce Tarawih prayers in congregation, three divorce utterances in one sitting and the formula *'Prayer is better than Sleep'* in the Fajr Adhan?[13] What right did he have to substitute Allah (swt)'s orders in favour of his own?

Confused?...well don't be, we can answer these questions and any others you might have, visit the Website - http://al-islam.org/index

10 "The affairs of the people will continue to be conducted as long as they are governed by 12 men, he then added from Quraish" (taken from Sahih Muslim, hadith number 4483, English translation by Abdul Hamid Siddiqui)

11 Sharra Fiqa Akbar, by Mulla Ali Qari, p 175 (publishers Muhummud Saeed and son, Qur'an Muhall, Karachi).

12 ibid, page 175

13 Al Faruq by Allamah Shibli Numani, Volume 2 page 338, English translation by Muhammad Saleem, (Ashraf Publishers)